Agenda Item F.1.d Supplemental Public Presentation 1 June 2019

## Concerns with Pacific Sardine Management



Ben Enticknap and Dr. Geoff Shester

June 20, 2019

PFMC Agenda Item F.1 NMFS Report





## Pacific Sardine Must Be Immediately Declared Overfished



## International Overfishing is Occurring



## New study published since April 2019

Fisheries Research 216 (2019) 120-125



Technical note

Re-evaluation of the environmental dependence of Pacific sardine recruitment



Juan P. Zwolinski<sup>a,\*</sup>, David A. Demer<sup>b</sup>

<sup>a</sup> Institute of Marine Sciences, University of California Santa Cruz, Earth and Marine Sciences Building, Rm A317, Santa Cruz, CA 95064, United States <sup>b</sup> Fisheries Resource Division, Southwest Fisheries Science Center, NMFS-NOAA, 8901 La Jolla Shores Dr., La Jolla, CA 92037, United States

- "using data from the latest, stock-differentiated assessments, we show that sardine recruitment does not vary significantly with [CalCOFI] SST annual."
- "Spurious relationship"
- Implication: Emsy of 26% overestimates current sardine productivity and does not prevent overfishing

| Point of Concern Criteria (CPS FMP)  | Rationale  |
|--|--|
| Any adverse or significant change in the biological characteristics of a species (age composition, size composition, age at maturity, or recruitment) is discovered. | Zwolinski & Demer 2019 discovered that CalCOFI temperature is no<br>longer a predictor of recruitment, which was the basis for the<br>temperature based Emsy of 26% used to calculate the 2019-20 sardine<br>OFL, ABC and ACL.   |
| An overfishing condition appears to be imminent or likely within two<br>years.   | Coastwide landings exceeded MSY in 2017 and 2018 according to the 2019 sardine assessment.<br>Stock is currently below MSST  |
| Developments in a foreign fishery occur that affect the likelihood of overfishing of CPS.  | Mexican catch levels have significantly increased in the last two years,<br>and have resulted in coastwide harvest rates exceeding MSY according<br>to the 2019 stock assessment. This is likely to continue unless<br>management actions are taken.                                   |
| Control rule (harvest policy) parameters or approaches require modification.   | CalCOFI temperature must be removed because it's not best available<br>science. The static 87% distribution is flawed and must be corrected.<br>Stock differentiation (northern and southern subpops) in assessments<br>means current management harvest parameters must be revisited. |