

PROVIDING THE NECESSARY COUNCIL MEETING RECORD EFFECTIVELY AND EFFICIENTLY

Introduction

The Pacific Fishery Management Council (Council) staff continuously seek ways to become more effective and efficient in their role of facilitating and supporting Council actions and operations. Going into our staff conference this year, one area that appeared ripe for improvement was in the creation of Council meeting minutes and the overall Council meeting record. This paper recommends an alternative to the current process of producing Council meeting minutes along with changes in how the current overall meeting record is maintained that we believe will result in better utilization of the staff while providing an improved, more timely, and more easily accessible Council meeting record.

Purpose and Need

Section 302(i)(2)(E) of the Magnuson-Stevens Act (MSA) requires that:

“Detailed minutes of each meeting of the Council, except for any closed session, shall be kept and shall contain a record of the persons present, a complete and accurate description of matters discussed and conclusions reached, and copies of all statements filed. The Chairman shall certify the accuracy of the minutes of each such meeting and submit a copy thereof to the Secretary. The minutes shall be made available to any court of competent jurisdiction.”

Under our current practice, the Council website contains the full record of Council meetings which includes all meeting documents and presentations, the Council Decisions Summary Document, summary minutes of the entire open session of the meeting with considerable details of Council action (generally 50 to 70 pages in length), a formal motion log, and The Line (Council news brief). Meeting attendance (sign-in) sheets are maintained at each Council meeting and available upon request from the office.

Creating this detailed meeting record takes considerable time and effort by Council staff and, considering the nature of the Council process, is a critically important function. However, developing the detailed summary minutes for the entire meeting can be rather tedious and unproductive in view of how staff could utilize their time on the many important issues working their way through the Council and National Marine Fisheries Service (NMFS). A majority of the meeting record may never be referred to again. However, the record for certain complex or contentious items may be vital to proper implementation of Council actions or court cases.

Council staff has reviewed the meeting record process and believes there is a more efficient and effective way to provide the detailed meeting minutes required by the MSA while at the same time enhancing the complete meeting record. By better utilizing the capabilities of our modern websites and audio and video recording and streaming, it is possible to provide the detailed meeting record with less time spent at arduous administrative tasks which produce products that may see very little demand or utilization (e.g., the detailed summary minutes). By streamlining production of the meeting record, Council staff can save hundreds of hours to dedicate to other highly critical projects and better utilize their unique qualifications and expertise in facilitating Council actions and helping to facilitate implementation of those actions by NMFS.

Alternatives

Background and Overall Range of Alternatives Considered

Council staff reviewed the requirements of the MSA for maintaining detailed minutes and conferred with other regional councils on how they met this requirement. We found considerable similarities as well as variation in the approaches. All Council's maintained some sort of record of persons attending the meeting, posted all documents and presentations to their websites, provided some sort of summary document of the Council meeting for general consumption, and posted all Council motions. Most Councils either obtained professional transcripts (averaging about 200 pages per three-day meeting at significant cost from outside sources), or provided some type of Council action summary minutes which might be more or less detailed than our own. In addition, several included access to gavel-to-gavel meeting recordings from their website which are annotated by agenda item or speaker.

Council staff assessed the pros and cons and adequacy of the various methods of maintaining a complete Council meeting record at their recent staff conference. From that assessment we have developed a proposed alternative (Alternative 1) to the current process which is described and compared with the status quo in the following pages.

Status Quo

The Council staff have been fulfilling the MSA meeting record requirements by creating, posting, and maintaining the following:

1. Meeting notice and proposed agenda for each Council meeting.
2. Attendance (sign-in) sheets at each Council meeting [“. . . record of persons present . . .”].
3. All meeting documents and presentations posted to our website (pcouncil.org) or made available from the office by request [“. . . copies of all statements filed . . .”].
4. A Council Decision Summary Document posted to our website immediately following each Council meeting [one of three parts of “. . . complete and accurate description of matters discussed and conclusions reached . . .”].
5. Detailed minutes posted to our website which summarize each meeting agenda item by listing the documents and presenters, as well as a summary of the discussion leading to the guidance or motions occurring under the Council action items (usually about 50 to 70 pages

per meeting) [one of three parts of “. . . complete and accurate description of matters discussed and conclusions reached . . .”].

6. A separate motion log appended to the minutes [one of three parts of “. . . complete and accurate description of matters discussed and conclusions reached . . .”].
7. Draft or final decision documents resulting from Council action, such as EIS’s and EA’s (available on the website or by request from the office).

Alternative 1

The Council staff’s proposed Alternative 1 is identical to Status Quo in that the website provides the complete record (under Briefing Book Archives) as laid out in more detail below. However, the detailed summary minutes are replaced by easy access from the website to the annotated gavel-to-gavel meeting recordings along with an official Council Meeting Record to be approved by the Council Chair which contains a brief summary of the Council decisions and motions for each action item.

Under the proposed alternative, the complete official Council meeting record would be provided as detailed below and noted by “status quo” or “new” (all records are posted to the Council website and/or available upon request from the Council office):

1. [Status Quo] Council Meeting Notice and Agenda.
2. [Status Quo] Meeting attendance record (not posted but available upon request from the office).
3. [Status Quo] All documents and presentations submitted for the Briefing Book prior to and at the meeting.
4. [**New**] Gavel-to-gavel audio recordings of the entire open session annotated by agenda line item, initial start time on the recording, and time of day with easy access link from the agenda or abbreviated agenda.
5. [Status Quo] Council Decisions Summary Document summarizing Council action highlights and periodic news briefs.
6. [**New**] Council meeting and motions summary containing complete agenda with brief summary of Council guidance and actions (likely taken from Council Decisions Summary Document) followed by the motions for each agenda item. [**Replaces the current detailed summary minutes and motion log.**]
7. [Status Quo] Draft or final decision documents resulting from Council action, such as EIS’s and EA’s (available on the website or by request from the office).

Appendix A contains examples of the new documents under the proposed alternative which would comprise the draft official meeting record to be approved by the Council and certified by the Council Chair. In addition, the last two pages of Appendix A are preliminary mock-ups of potential new pages on the Council website.

Impact of Alternative 1

Meeting MSA Requirements

Staff believes that nothing could provide more “detailed minutes” (as required by the MSA) than the audio recordings of the complete open session of the meetings. Linking the recordings to the website and annotating them by agenda line item makes accessing the complete details of any portion of the meeting relatively quick and painless to almost everyone. In special cases that require it (e.g., court cases or likely court cases, or a compelling need by an agency or member of the public), a transcript or more detailed summary of specific agenda items or discussions could be made. This is a rather rare occurrence (staff is aware of only one such case in at least the past 5 years¹). For those who do not need all of the details or can’t listen to the recordings, there are still the written summaries in the Council Decision Summary Document and the meeting and motions summary (listed as #5 and #7 in the Council Meeting Record contained in Appendix A). Additional details are also provided in Council news briefs.

Effective Utilization of Staff and Funding

The main difference and advantage of the proposed alternative is in substituting easy access to the gavel-to-gavel, annotated audio recordings of the Council meeting and a reduced summary document for the current more detailed written summary minutes. This one change could save hundreds of hours of staff time and better utilize their training and expertise to facilitate Council actions and their implementation.² In addition, eliminating some of the more tedious and less rewarding tasks can improve staff moral which in turn can increase staff productivity.

Timeliness

Due to the workload and priorities under status quo, posting of the completed and approved detailed summary minutes usually lags several Council meetings behind the actual Council action. Under the proposed alternative, the annotated recordings could be posted within a week or less of the meeting (possibly even during the meeting) and the shortened summary minutes and motions would likely be available for approval at the next Council meeting (with the possible exception of the March meeting which is followed within three weeks by the April meeting).

Other

Under Alternative 1, there will be less summary discussion available in writing for those who prefer written documents rather than listening to an audio recording. Also, sometimes Council members (or anyone for that matter) may make misstatements that might mislead the listener if they review only a short segment of the discussion on the recording. Those misstatements can usually be cleared-up by listening to more of the recording. However, in regard to issues that bear

¹ Reconsideration of Initial Catch Share Allocations in the Mothership and Shoreside Pacific Whiting Fisheries (9/17/2012).

² A precise estimate of time saved is difficult to make, given variations in Council meetings, minutes process, and over-lapping of staff tasks. However, likely conservative estimates consistently indicate a potential savings of total staff time of about 500 hours per year.

on the Council decision, the intent should be clear in the staff's written summary and motions that will still form the primary written record for the Council and public.

Implementation of Alternative 1 may require a minor housekeeping revision of the wording in Council Operating Procedure 1, page 7 under "Minutes."

APPENDIX A

EXAMPLE OF DOCUMENTS AND WEBSITE PAGES TO IMPLEMENT STAFF PROPOSED ALTERNATIVE 1

APPROVAL OF DRAFT COUNCIL MEETING RECORD

The draft September 2014 Pacific Fishery Management Council (Council) Meeting Record is provided for Council review and approval in Agenda Item I.3.a, Attachment 1.

Council Action:

Review and approve the draft Council Meeting Record for the September 2014 Council Meeting.

Reference Materials:

1. Agenda Item I.3.a, Attachment 1: Draft Council Meeting Record: 225th Session of the Pacific Fishery Management Council (September 2014).

Agenda Order:

- a. Council Member Review and Comments Dorothy Lowman
- b. **Council Action:** Approve Draft Council Meeting Record for the Previous Meeting(s)

PFMC
10/15/14

DRAFT COUNCIL MEETING RECORD

225th Session of the

Pacific Fishery Management Council

September 12-17, 2014

Doubletree Hotel Spokane City Center

322 North Spokane Falls Court; Spokane, WA 99201

INTRODUCTION

This document contains or identifies the various elements, documents, and sources comprising the complete and official record of Council meeting discussions and actions. In addition to the Meeting Summary, which follows this introductory section (see #7 below), it includes information or references that serve as the functional detailed minutes for this Council meeting as required by §302(i)(2)(E) of the Magnuson-Stevens Act. The full record is maintained at the Council office, is available on the Council website (<http://www.pcouncil.org/>) or upon request from the Council office, and consists of the following:

1. The meeting notice and proposed agenda (agenda available online at <http://www.pcouncil.org/resources/archives/briefing-books/>).
2. Attendance records for the Council meeting and each advisory body meeting are available by request from the Council office.
3. All documents produced for consideration at the Council meeting, including (1) all documents produced or received for the meeting briefing book, validated by a label assigned by the Council Secretariat and distributed to Council Members; (2) written public comments received at the Council meeting in accordance with agenda labeling requirements; and (3) electronic material or handout materials used in presentations to Council Members during the open session (available online at <http://www.pcouncil.org/council-operations/council-meetings/past-meetings/>).
4. The Council Decisions Summary Document. This document is distributed immediately after the meeting and contains very brief descriptions of Council decisions (available online at <http://www.pcouncil.org/resources/archives/council-meeting-decisions/>).
5. Draft or final decision documents finalized after the Council meeting, such as Environmental Impact Statements or Environmental Assessments.
6. Gavel-to-gavel audio recordings of the testimony, presentations, discussions, and actions occurring at the meeting. Recordings are labeled by date and time and have been annotated as to the time on the recording of the start of each agenda line item to facilitate review. The recordings may be accessed at <http://www.pcouncil.org/council-operations/council-meetings/past-meetings/>.
7. Meeting Summary (immediately following this section). The Meeting Summary lists the briefing book documents and reports, and the Council actions and motions in agenda item order. References in brackets refer to the audio recording for the agenda item, and/or to the elapsed time on the audio recording at which the agenda item was initiated. Links to the audio recordings are annotated by agenda item and can be accessed at <http://www.pcouncil.org/council-operations/council-meetings/past-meetings/>.

MEETING SUMMARY

A. Call to Order [[Recording 9-12-14am1](#)]

A.1 Opening Remarks [[0:00:09](#)]

A.2 Roll Call [[0:03:16](#)]

The following Council members were present during the meeting:

National Marine Fisheries Service:	Dr. Peter Dygert, designee Mr. Mark Helvey, designee Mr. Frank Lockhart, designee Mr. Bob Turner, designee
Alaska State Official:	Ms. Stefanie Moreland (nonvoting)
Washington State Official:	Mr. Kyle Adicks, designee Mr. Phil Anderson Ms. Michele Culver, designee Mr. Corey Niles, designee
Washington Obligatory:	Mr. Rich Lincoln
Oregon State Official:	Dr. Caren Braby, designee Mr. Troy Buell, designee Mr. Chris Kern, designee Ms. Gway Kirchner, designee
Oregon Obligatory:	Ms. Dorothy Lowman, Chair
California State Official:	Mr. Bob Farrell, designee Ms. Joanna Grebel, designee Ms. Marci Yaremko, designee
California Obligatory:	Mr. David Crabbe
Idaho State Official:	Mr. Cal Groen, designee Mr. David Ortmann, designee
Idaho Obligatory:	Mr. Herb Pollard, Vice Chair
Tribal Official:	Mr. David Sones
At-Large:	Mr. William L. "Buzz" Brizendine Mr. Jeff Feldner Mr. Dale Myer Mr. Dan Wolford
Pacific States Marine Fisheries Commission:	Dr. David Hanson, Parliamentarian, nonvoting designee
U.S. Coast Guard:	LCDR Gregg Casad, nonvoting designee

The following Council members were absent from the meeting:

U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service:	Dr. Steven Haeseker, nonvoting designee
U.S. State Department:	Mr. David Hogan, nonvoting designee

A.3 Executive Director's Report [0:04:26]

- [Informational Report 1](#): Regional Electronic Technologies Implementation Plan for Marine Fisheries in the West Coast Region
- [Informational Report 2](#): Oceana Bycatch Response Letter dated July 14, 2014 to the 2014 Council Coordination Committee
- [Informational Report 3](#): Pacific Halibut Bycatch in U.S. West Coast Groundfish Fisheries (2002-2013); Publication Date: August 2014
- [Supplemental Informational Report 4](#): NOAA Announcement of proposed rule for Regulating Offshore Marine Aquaculture in the Gulf of Mexico
- [Supplemental Informational Report 5](#): Letter dated August 27, 2014, from the Olympic Coast Intergovernmental Policy Council (IPC) to invite Stephen Gittings, NOAA's National Marine Sanctuary Program Science Director, to participate in a scientific technical working group off the Washington Coast
- [Supplemental Informational Report 6](#): Revision of Seafood Watch Guidelines
- [Supplemental Informational Report 7](#): NMFS Report – NMFS Response to Council's Questions Concerning the Effectiveness, Accuracy, and Completeness of Pacific Coast Groundfish EFH
- [Supplemental Informational Report 8](#): Status Report of the 2014 Ocean Salmon Fisheries off Washington, Oregon, and California; Preliminary Data Through August 31, 2014
- [Supplemental Informational Report 9](#): NMFS Notification – Release of the Columbia River Hatchery Final Environmental Impact Statement (“The Mitchell Act EIS”)
- [Supplemental Informational Report 10](#): West Coast Region Report on Salmon Related Management Items
- [Supplemental Informational Report 11](#): President Obama Announces More Key Administration Posts; Press Release dated September 9, 2014
- [Supplemental Informational Report 12](#): Approval Letter for Amendment 18 to the Pacific Coast Salmon Fishery Management Plan

A.4 Agenda

- [Agenda Item A.4](#): **September 10-17, 2014 Council Meeting Agenda**

A.4.a Council Action: Approve Agenda [0:18:41]

Motion: Adopt Agenda Item A.4, September 10-17, 2014 Council Meeting Agenda, with Agenda Item I.3 to be cancelled and Agenda item I.2 to be determined.
David Crabbe/Buzz Brizendine (14/0/0).

B. Open Comments [[Recording 9-12-14am1](#)]

B.1 Comments on Non-Agenda Items

- [Agenda Item B.1](#): Comments on Non-Agenda Items

B.1.a Agenda Item Overview [[0:19:58](#)]

B.1.b Reports and Comments of Advisory Bodies and Management Entities [[0:21:02](#)]

B.1.c Public Comment [[0:21:04](#)]

- [Agenda Item B.1.c, Public Comment 1](#): Tri-Marine Letter Regarding Squid Fleet Capacity
- [Agenda Item B.1.c, Supplemental Public Comment 2](#): Letter from PCFFA in Support for Petition for Review in *North Coast Rivers Alliance v. Westlands Water District*, Docket No. S220532
- [Agenda Item I.6.c, Supplemental Public Comment](#)

B.1.d Council Discussion of Comments as Appropriate [[0:40:01](#)]

C. Coastal Pelagic Species Management [[Recording 9-12-14am1; 0:25:00](#)]

C.1 Pacific Sardine Harvest Fraction [[0:25:01](#)]

- [Agenda Item C.1](#): Pacific Sardine Harvest Fraction

C.1.a Agenda Item Overview [[0:25:28](#)]

- [Agenda Item C.1.a, Attachment 1](#): Preliminary Draft Environmental Assessment for incorporating best available science into harvest management control rules for Pacific sardine Agenda
- [Agenda Item C.1.b, Supplemental CPSMT PowerPoint](#) (Wargo)

C.1.b Reports and Comments of Advisory Bodies and Management Entities [[1:09:48](#)]

- [Agenda Item C.1.b, Supplemental CPSMT Report](#)
- [Agenda Item C.1.b, Supplemental SSC Report](#)
- [Agenda Item C.1.b, Supplemental CPSAS Report](#)

C.1.c Public Comment [[Recording 9-12-14am2](#)]

- [Agenda Item C.1.c, Public Comment](#)
- [Agenda Item C.1.c, Supplemental Public Comment 2](#) (*Full Version Electronic Only*)
- [Agenda Item C.1.c, Supplemental Public Comment 3](#) (Shester PowerPoint)

C.1.d Council Action: Adopt Preliminary Preferred Alternative for the Pacific Sardine Harvest Fraction Parameter [[0:31:47](#)]

Action Summary - *The Council considered a preliminary draft environmental assessment on Pacific sardine harvest fraction, but did not select a preliminary preferred alternative. The Council*

tasked the Coastal Pelagic Species Management Team with developing more direct harvest policy comparisons between (1) the four alternatives using the CalCOFI temperature data, the new temperature-recruitment relationship, and the more recent time series, and (2) the status quo use of the Scripps Pier temperature data, the prior temperature-recruitment relationship; and an earlier time series. Council final action is scheduled for the November Council meeting.

Motion: None.

D. Salmon Management [[Recording 9-12-14pm1](#)]

D.1 Salmon Methodology Review

- [Agenda Item D.1](#): Salmon Methodology Review

D.1.a Agenda Item Overview [[0:00:16](#)]

- [Agenda Item D.1.a, Attachment 1](#): May 14, 2014 email to the agencies from Mike Burner regarding preliminary topic selection

D.1.b Reports and Comments of Advisory Bodies and Management Entities [[0:03:55](#)]

- [Agenda Item D.1.b, Supplemental MEW Report](#)
- [Agenda Item D.1.b, Supplemental SSC Report](#)
- [Agenda Item D.1.b, Supplemental STT Report](#)

D.1.c Public Comment

None.

D.1.d Council Action: Adopt Final Review Priorities [[0:10:38](#)]

Action Summary: *The Council approved the following five preliminary topics identified in April for review this fall.*

- *Willapa Bay natural coho conservation objective, annual catch limit and status determination criteria.*
- *Southern Oregon coastal Chinook conservation objective.*
- *Standardized method for calculation of age-2 Fishery Regulation Assessment Model (FRAM) stock scalars.*
- *Progress report on new Chinook FRAM base period.*
- *New conservation objective for Grays Harbor Chinook.*

Additionally the Council approved the following items for the methodology review.

- *Estimated non-local Chinook stock impacts in terminal fisheries.*
- *Review of fishery impact estimation methodology relative to the Cape Flattery Control Zone.*
- *An update on the review of new methods for salmon economic analyses.*

The annual methodology review meeting is tentatively scheduled for October 21-23, 2014 in Portland, Oregon.

Motion: None.

D.2 Lower Columbia River Coho Harvest Matrix [[Recording 9-12-14pm1](#)]

- [Agenda Item D.2](#): Lower Columbia River Natural Coho Harvest Matrix

D.2.a Agenda Item Overview [[0:15:03](#)]

- [Agenda Item D.2.a, Attachment 1](#): Review of Allowable Fishery Impacts to Lower Columbia River Natural Coho
- [Agenda Item D.2.a, Supplemental Attachment 2](#): Lower Columbia Natural Coho Model Runs highlighted during the September 3rd meeting of the Salmon Advisory Subpanel and the ad hoc Lower Columbia River Natural Coho Workgroup

D.2.b Reports and Comments of Advisory Bodies and Management Entities [[0:23:22](#)]

- [Agenda Item D.2.b, LRC Workgroup Report](#)
- [Agenda Item D.2.b, Supplemental LRC Workgroup PowerPoint](#) (presented by Stuart Ellis)
- [Agenda Item D.2.b, Supplemental SSC Report](#)
- [Agenda Item D.2.b, Supplemental STT Report](#)
- [Agenda Item D.2.b, Supplemental SAS Report](#)

D.2.c Public Comment

None.

D.2.d Council Action: Consider Alternatives for a Harvest Control Rule for Lower Columbia River Natural Coho and a Preliminary Preferred Alternative; Provide Additional Guidance as Necessary [[1:12:29](#)]

Action Summary - *The Council approved the following purpose statement for this action: Council intent is to incorporate new information on Lower Columbia River natural coho populations and stock status, evaluate the risk of various harvest strategies on populations across the Evolutionarily Significant Unit (ESU), and determine if a revised harvest policy can be developed that simplifies existing harvest rules and optimizes fishing strategies consistent with acceptable conservation risk tolerances in coordination with the applicable state and federal recovery plans.*

Working from [Agenda Item D.2.a, Supplemental Attachment 2](#), the Council expressed a general preference for new matrix options 4b, 5b, 6b, and 7.5b1. The full range of alternatives was adopted for public review. The Lower Columbia River Coho Workgroup analysis report will be updated and revised as appropriate between now and the November Council meeting where the Council is scheduled to adopt final recommendations to the National Marine Fisheries Service (NMFS) for use in managing relevant salmon fisheries in 2015 and beyond.

Motion: Adopt the purpose statement as shown in Agenda Item D.2.b, LCR Workgroup Report (the text in italics between paragraphs 3 and 4 on page 1).

Chris Kern/Jeff Feldner

Amendment: Add “in coordination with applicable state and Federal recovery plans” following “tolerances” at the end of the purpose statement.

Phil Anderson/Rich Lincoln (14/0/0)

Motion passed as amended (14/0/0).

[\[Recording 9-12-14pm2\]](#)

Motion: Adopt as preliminary alternatives Models 4b, 5b, 6b, and 7.5b1 from Agenda item D.2. a, Supplemental Attachment 2. Include a preference to do a three-year review after implementation.

Chris Kern/Phil Anderson (14/0/0).

...

September 2014 Council Meeting

September 12, 2014 to September 17, 2014

Doubletree Hotel Spokane City Center
322 North Spokane Falls Court
Spokane, WA 99201
Phone: 509-455-9600

[September 2014 Briefing Book](#)

[**September 2014 Council Meeting Annotated Audio Files**](#)

[September 2014 Council Meeting Decision Summary Documents](#)

This entry was posted on Monday, September 22nd, 2014 at 2:26 pm and is filed under [Council Meetings](#), [Council operations](#).

Last modified: 09/22/2014

Meeting Text File Generated During Recording at Council Meeting
(Staff to post a cleaned-up version to website with audio link)

Recording 9-12-14am1.bkm.txt [[link to audio file](#)]

Time On Disk	Time of Day	<u>Agenda Item</u>
0:00:37	09:03	Friday, September 12, 2014
0:00:38	09:03	General Council Session
0:00:40	09:03	A. Call to Order
0:00:40	09:03	A.1 Opening Remarks/Roll Call Dorothy Lowman, Chair
0:04:26	09:07	A.3 Executive Director's Report Don McIsaac
0:18:47	09:21	A.4 Agenda Dorothy Lowman
0:18:48	09:21	A.4.a Council Action: Approve Agenda
0:19:58	09:22	B. Open Comment Period
0:19:59	09:22	B.1 Comments on Non-Agenda Items
0:20:04	09:22	B.1.a Agenda Item Overview Chuck Tracy
0:23:23	09:26	B.1.c Public Comment
0:24:29	09:27	B.1.d Council Discussion of Comments as Appropriate
0:24:40	09:27	C. Coastal Pelagic Species Management
0:24:41	09:27	C.1 Pacific Sardine Harvest Fraction
0:25:28	09:28	C.1.a Agenda Item Overview Kerry Griffin/Lorna Wargo
1:09:48	10:12	C.1.b Reports and Comments of Advisory Bodies and Management Entities
1:22:56	10:25	Stop Recording [10:25]